A Response to Hamza Tzortzis

A Response to Hamza Tzortzis

By Rajesh
2006/03/09

I have been closely following your debate with Mr.Hamza Tzortzis and he is trying rock-hard with garrulous arguments to sway the gullible audiences and to make them think as if there is something mysterious in the Quran that is inimitable. Added to that ramblings are the opinions (subjective as Ali called it) of so-called western scholars, which make the naïve, Muslim audiences, go frenzy. The reason why I am writing this response, if not rebuttal, is because a couple of years ago I was one of those gullible audiences.

I am a Hindu and I used to believe that Hinduism being the oldest religion is the best religion and a true way of life. Ask me if I actually read any of the scriptures like The Gita, Ramayana or Upanishads. My answer would be negative. Yet, I am definitely more informed than an average Hindu thanks to my little knowledge of Sanskrit. What made me think that Hinduism is the only true religion? There are many reasons like the mysticism that is ubiquitous and inherent in all Hindu Literature, **Opinions of western scholars, and articles on how Hinduism is a scientific religion** etc. Currently, I am a freethinker and why I turned into a freethinker is altogether a different story, which I do not want to discuss here.

Hamza opines that the Quran has a unique linguistic structure that is so complex that it is inimitable and hence should have been the Word of God. So is the case with Gita, written in Sanskrit, believed to be Mother of all languages, in a very clear and wonderful way the Supreme Lord Krishna describes the science of self-realization and the exact process by which a human being can establish their eternal relationship with God. In terms of pure, spiritual knowledge the Bhagavad- Gita is incomparable1. See, Gita is inimitable neither.

Now coming to the linguistic features, Gita is not devoid of it. All the tongue-twisting linguistic nomenclature Mr.Hamza provided is a part of any literary piece, even if written in Martian language. And when it comes to linguistics, it is believed that the greatest of all poets is Kalidasa (agreed by many western scholars) and many of his literary works are so complex that it is almost impossible to imitate them. According to Hamza's twisted logic, I may have to classify Kalidasa's works as true word of God. On the similar lines, why leave Shakespeare and William Wordsworth.

Allow me to introduce Mr. Kalidasa with one of his masterpieces.

The Old is not necessarily admirable, And the New always despicable; The wise discriminate and decide; ***Fools let others decide for them****.* -- Kalidasa, Act I, Malavikagnimitra

Muslims depend on Western scholars' opinions on the Quran and the bolded line of the above statement is indeed prophetic and true in the case of Muslim audiences. In fact a couple of years ago, I was in the same position. Every time I come across a statement from a westerner on Hinduism, my joy knew no bounds.

Secondly, as rightly pointed out by Ali Sina, the Quran is supposed to be a book of guidance for all mankind, yet if all the verses are structured with Hysteron, Proteron, Tail-Head/Head-Tail Structures, Syntactico-Rhetorical Interfertilization, ellipses, trigonometry, differential calculus and what not which actually scares the average reader. May I ask, what is the need for the Almighty to show His linguistic expertise unless he is competing for a Nobel Prize in literature? Would not it have been more effective if he had presented his message in a clear, concise and simple language where even a layman can understand and put it to practice?

My grandfather, himself a poet, used to tell me that it is very easy for a poet to compose a poem using extra-ordinary language with deeply defined linguistic structure where as extremely difficult to compose it using very simple language. He gave me an example of 17th Century poet called Vemana, who composed a collection of poems called ***Vemana Satakam*** (his works are translated into English by Western Scholar Charles Phillip Brown) in a South-Indian language, Telugul. All his poems/stanzas comprises of:

1. Four lines which follows *Aata Veladhi* metre, a grammatical structure in Telugu
2. Each line is very short and addresses various issues of life
3. Frequently uses metaphors and similes
4. Composed in simplest language that even school children understand
5. The final line is common in all the stanzas which reads Listen, oh wise one.

Effectively, he has three very short lines to convey his idea but the results are standing. Look at some of his gems.

On Religion:

Observances void of purity of heart! To what end are they?
To what end is preparation of the most delicious recipe without cleansing the vessel?
Void of purity of mind, to what end is the worship of god?

A false teacher restraints us in all our acts.
The middling, ordinary teacher makes a multitude of senseless spells.
But the good one combines the whole power of excellence.

Profitless are those men who do not love mankind: what though they be born in the world? What though they die? Are not the white ants of the hillock also born? And do they not die also?

On lasciviousness:

At the sight of women the cupidinous man quits his meal,
being stricken with desire; even as the grasshopper
delights in viewing the fire that will destroy it.

On enemies: (Compare the following simple verse with multi-chandelier syntactic Quranic verse 2:191)

Though a foe worthy of death fall into thy hand,
afflict him no pain: Conciliate him by goodness and
bid him depart. This is a death to him

On Garrulous talk:

The light man will always talk big,
but the excellent speaks coolly.
Consider, will golden temple bell ring like temple bell made of bell metal?

On a fool:

Any one can instruct a man of understanding but
it is not in the power of others to teach the vile:
Is it possible to straighten the bend in the river?

There are literally hundreds of them, yet all those are written in a very simple language, unlike the Quran, which even school children can understand. The author of the above, Vemana, was also an illiterate, visit http://www.sacred-texts.com/hin/vov/vov01.htm for more about the author. And again, ***Vemana Satakam*** is inimitable too. Just because something is inimitable, that doesn't mean that it has come from God.

And coming to the point of opinions of Western Scholars, may I ask you why the Inimitable Quran needs endorsement from infidel westerner? Isn't this a tacit admission that the kafir westerners are brainier than the Muslims who are guided by the Quran? Similarly, Internet is replete with sites claiming the Quran is scientific. Again; why some thing that is sent by God needs endorsement by man-made Science, western science to be precise?

Finally, if western opinions are what you care for, then here are some quotes2 about Hinduism by western intellectuals.

Bhagavad-Geeta is the most beautiful philosophical song existing in any known tongue

-------- Julius Robert Oppenheimer (1904-1967) Scientist, philosopher, bohemian, and radical. A theoretical physicist and the Supervising Scientist for the Manhattan Project, the developer of the atomic bomb

Vedanta teaches that consciousness is singular, all happenings are played out in one universal consciousness and there is no multiplicity of selves.

---------- **Erwin Schroedinger** (1887--1961) Austrian theoretical physicist, was a professor at several universities in Europe . He was awarded the Nobel prize **Quantum Mechanics**, in 1933

"In the morning I bathe my intellect in the stupendous and cosmogonal philosophy of the Bhagavat Geeta, since whose composition years of the gods have elapsed, and in comparison with which our modern world and its literature seem puny and trivial

---------- **Henry David Thoreau** (1817-1862) American Philosopher, Unitarian, social critic, transcendentalist and writer.

I hesitate not to pronounce the Geeta a performance of great originality, of sublimity of conception, reasoning and diction almost unequalled; and a single exception, amongst all the known religions of mankind

---------- **Lord Warren Hastings** (1754-1826), was the first governor general of British India

I owed a magnificent day to the Bhagavad-Gita. It was as if an empire spoke to us, nothing small or unworthy, but large, serene, consistent, the voice of an old intelligence which in another age and climate had pondered and thus disposed of the same questions which exercise us The Indian teaching, through its clouds of legends, has yet a simple and grand religion, like a queenly countenance seen through a rich veil. It teaches to speak truth, love others, and to dispose trifles. The East is grand - and makes Europe appear the land of trifles. ...**all is soul and the soul is Vishnu**

---------- **Ralph Waldo Emerson** (1803-1882) an author, essayist, lecturer, philosopher, Unitarian minister who lectured on theology at Harvard University .

There is none so rare and priceless as the Gita."

---------- **Annie Wood Besant** (1847-1933) was an active socialist on the executive committee of the **Fabian Society along with George Bernard Shaw**

The Bhagavad-Gita is the most systematic statement of spiritual evolution of endowing value to mankind. The Gita is one of the clearest and most comprehensive summaries of the spiritual thoughts ever to have been made."

---------- **Aldous Huxley** (1894-1963) the English novelist and essayist

I am convinced that everything has come down to us from the banks of the Ganges, India - astronomy, astrology, metempsychosis, etc

---------- **Francois Voltaire** (1694-1774) France 's greatest writers and philosophers

Vedanta is the most impressive metaphysics the human mind has conceived.

----------Alfred North Whitehead (1861-1947), British mathematician, logician and philosopher best known for his work in mathematical logic and who, in collaboration with Bertrand Russell, authored the landmark three-volume **Principia Mathematica**

The Hindus were Spinozists more than 2,000 years before the advent of Spinoza, and Darwinians many centuries before Darwin and Evolutionists many centuries before the doctrine of Evolution was accepted by scientists of the present age .The Panini grammar , Sanskrit Grammar, reflects the wondrous capacity of the human brain, which till today no other country has been able to produce except India

---------- Sir Monier Monier-Williams (1860-1888) Indologist and head of the Oxford 's Boden Chair

The Vedic literature opens to us a chamber in the education of human race to which we can find no parallel anywhere else. Whoever cares for the historical growth of our language and thought, whoever cares for the first intelligent development of religion and mythology, whoever cares for the first foundation of Science, Astronomy, Metronomy, Grammar and Etymology, whoever cares for the first intimation of the first philosophical thoughts, for the first attempt at regulating family life, village life and state life as founded on religion, ceremonials, traditions and contact must in future pay full attention to the study of Vedic literature

---------- Friedrich Maximilian Müeller (1823-1900) German philologist and Orientalist

Access to the Vedas is the greatest privilege this century may claim over all previous centuries

----------T S Elliot,

It is the only religion in which the time scales correspond, to those of modern scientific cosmology.

---------- Dr. Carl Sagan, (1934-1996) famous astrophysicist, in his book

And the list is endless. The above western scholars are not Dr.Maurice Bucailles, Zammits, Robinsons and Gibbs that Mr. Hamza took refuge in. The above scholars I quoted need no introduction. I have to admit that the above are only opinions and are subjective. In light of above expert opinions I am interested to see if Mr. Hamza considers Hinduism as a true and only religion or refrain from *argumentum ad verecundium* and prove us that Quran is true word of God.

References:

1. www.Bhagavad-gita.org

2. www.atributetohinduism.com